

## **Research Project for Degree of LL.B.**

A comparative analysis of the principle of *Ubberrimae Fedis* in marine insurance contracts of Pakistan.



### **Research Project Supervisor**

Sir Jahanzeb Butt

### **Group Members**

Mohammad Abdullah Asif (01-177132-027)

Omar Hashmi (01-177132-037)

### **Date of Submission**

07-May-2018

### **Department of Law**

**Bahria University, Islamabad**

**Research Project for the Degree of LL.B.**

**Supervisor's Approval**

I hereby, forward this work done by

**Mohammad Abdullah Asif (01-177132-027),**

**Omar Hashmi (01-177132-037),**

to the research committee for the final evaluation.

**Supervisor: Sir Jahanzeb Butt**

Supervisor's Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

07<sup>th</sup> May 2018.

**Department of Law**

**Bahria University, Islamabad**

# **Research Project for the Degree of LL.B.**

## **Declaration of Ethical Conduct in Research**

We, as students of Bahria University, hereby declare that firstly, we have abided by the research ethics while writing this research project.

Secondly, we have not committed any acts that may discredit or damage the credibility of our research. These include, but are not limited to: falsification, distortion of research findings, or plagiarism.

Thirdly, we have subjected this work to plagiarism check before submitting the research project.

**Date:** 7<sup>th</sup> May 2018.

**Degree:** LL.B.

**Department:** Law.

**Supervisor's Name:** Sir Jahanzeb Butt.

**Name & Signature of Students:**

Mohammad Abdullah Asif (01-177132-027) \_\_\_\_\_

Omar Hashmi (01-177132-037) \_\_\_\_\_

# Plagiarism Report

## **Acknowledgment**

We would like to thank Allah Almighty and His Beloved Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) for giving us the strength to complete our research.

We also express our heartiest gratitude to our supervisor Sir Jahanzeb Butt who guided us and helped us in our research paper, without his direction we won't be able to achieve our objective in our research, without him we were directionless as he guided us by correcting of our mistakes and enhancing our research; and also to our teachers, who have taught us everything and guided us in the right path; to our class fellows, seniors and juniors who have supported and helped us in many different ways.

Our work is dedicated to our parent, family members and friends whose affection and love made us possible to complete this research. Their support was massive at every step without them we won't be standing what we are today.

We hope that our work and efforts have produced something beneficial for others.

## Contents

|                                                                                                                                              |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| List of Authorities .....                                                                                                                    | i   |
| Abstract .....                                                                                                                               | iii |
| Title .....                                                                                                                                  | 1   |
| Research Statement .....                                                                                                                     | 1   |
| Introduction .....                                                                                                                           | 1   |
| Literature Review .....                                                                                                                      | 5   |
| Objectives of Research .....                                                                                                                 | 9   |
| Research Question .....                                                                                                                      | 10  |
| Research Methodology .....                                                                                                                   | 10  |
| Chapter 1. Historical Interpretational Development of the Principle of Ubberrimae Fedis, and Adoption of ‘Narrow’ Approach in Pakistan. .... | 11  |
| 1.1. The Principle of Ubberrimae Fedis .....                                                                                                 | 11  |
| 1.2. Historical legal interpretation of Ubberrimae Fedis .....                                                                               | 11  |
| 1.2.1. 18 <sup>th</sup> Century Development .....                                                                                            | 12  |
| 1.2.2. Development in 19 <sup>th</sup> Century .....                                                                                         | 13  |
| 1.2.2.1. Broad Approach .....                                                                                                                | 14  |
| 1.2.3. 20 <sup>th</sup> Century Development .....                                                                                            | 15  |
| 1.3. Meaning of Disclosure in Marine Insurance .....                                                                                         | 16  |
| 1.3.1. Alleged Material Facts .....                                                                                                          | 17  |
| 1.3.1.1. Insurer questions .....                                                                                                             | 17  |
| 1.3.1.2. Previous Losses and Rejection .....                                                                                                 | 19  |

|                                                                                                          |    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1.4. Defects in the Principle of Ubberrimae Fides .....                                                  | 20 |
| 1.5. Approach in Pakistan.....                                                                           | 21 |
| Chapter 2. Analysis on Principle in the Context of UK Law and Compare it with the Laws of Pakistan ..... | 24 |
| 2.1. Present Application of Ubberrimae Fedis: .....                                                      | 24 |
| 2.2. Condemnations on Principle in UK.....                                                               | 28 |
| 2.2.1. Four Standards of Alleged Material Facts .....                                                    | 28 |
| 2.3. Pakistani Laws Constrained by English Courts:.....                                                  | 30 |
| 2.4. Principle of Ubberrimae Fedis with Existing Insurance Laws in Pakistan .....                        | 32 |
| 2.4.1. Trend in Courts of Pakistan.....                                                                  | 33 |
| 2.5. Duty of Disclosure to Duty of Fair Presentation of Risk .....                                       | 35 |
| 2.6. Marine Insurance with Aspect to ‘Broad’ Approach.....                                               | 37 |
| Conclusion and Recommendations .....                                                                     | 39 |
| Section 18 of the Marine Insurance Act 2017 should be reconsidered by the law makers. ....               | 40 |
| Bibliography .....                                                                                       | 41 |

## List of Authorities

- Carter v Boehm, (1766) 3 Burr. 1905. (U.K.).
- Lindenau v Desbrough, (1828) 8 B. & C. 586. (U.K).
- Bates v. Hewitt, (1867) L.R. 2 Q.B. 696. (U.S.A).
- Joel v Law Union, (1908) 2 K.B. 863 (C.A.).
- Australia v Eagle Wharves Ltd, (1960) 2 Lloyd's Rep. 241. (U.K).
- Glicksman v. Lancashire and General Assurance Co, (1927) 2.C. 139 (U.K).
- Marc Rich v. Portman, (1996) 1 Lloyd's Rep 430. (U.K).
- Becker v. Marshall, (1922) 12 L1. L.R. 413. (C.A).
- Bate v Aviva Insurance, (2013) EWHC 1687. (U.K).
- Sealion Shipping Ltd v. Valiant Insurance Co, (2012) 1 Lloyd's Rep IR 141. (U.K).
- Pan Atlantic Insurance v. Pine Top Insurance co, (1994) 2 Lloyd's Rep 427. (U.K).
- Stipcich v. Metropolitan Life Ins, (1928). Co, 277 U.S. 311. (U.S.A).
- Australia v. Colonial, (1960) 2 Lloyd's Rep. 241. (U.K).
- Woollcott v. Sun Alliance, (1978) 1 Lloyd's Rep. 629. (U.K).
- Pimm v Lewis, (1862) 2 F.& F. 778. (U.K).
- Brotherton v. Aseguradora Colseguros, (2003) 1 Lloyd's Rep 183. (U.K).
- Anglo California Bank v London and Provincial Marine, (1862) 2 F. & F. 778. (U.K).
- Lee v. Hall, (1929) 16 L.L.R. 100. (U.K).
- Sabah Shipyard v. Pakistan, (2002) EWCA Civ 1643. (Pak).
- Baghlaf v. Pakistan National Shipping Co. (2000) 1 Lloyd's Rep. 1 (U.K).
- State Life Insurance Corporation of Pakistan v. Javid Iqbal, (2011) SCMR 1013. (Pak).



- State life insurance corporation v. Shumaila, (2013) C L D 1525. (Pak).
- State Life Insurance Corporation of Pakistan v. Razi ur Rehman, (2009) CLD 1666. (Pak).
- Cantiere Meccanico Brindisino v. Janson, (1912) 8 E.B. 452 (U.K).
- Mayne v. Walter, (1782) 99 Eng. Rep. 548. (U.K).
- Premier Insurance Company of Pakistan Ltd v. Karachi Shipyard and Engineering Works (2017) Y L R 1551. (Pak)

## Abstract

The research project is related to the importance of the legal interpretation of the principle of *Ubberrimae Fedis* (the utmost good faith) and decide which approach is better for country. It is important to highlight that in Marine Insurance Act 2017, the principle is incorporated without any interpretation backing it up. It is pertinent to mention that in Insurance Ordinance 2000, the laws and policies there does not apply on marine insurance contract as the similarities existing between them is already removed. So, the country must need to interpret the principle according to its laws and should stop blindly following the English courts and choose which principle's approach is better for the country for future concerns.