INDEPENDENCE AND ACCOUNTABILITY OF JUDICIARY: A CASE STUDY OF PAKISTAN



Supervised By

Madam Hafiza Amna Sadia

Submitted By

Zain Alam Yousafzai (01-177182-053)

Date of Submission:

5th June, 2023

Department of Law

Bahria University, Islamabad.

SUPERVISOR'S APPROVAL

I hereby, forward this work done by

Zain Alam Yousafzai, to the Research Committee for final evaluation.

Name of Supervisor: Hafiza Amna Sadia

Supervisor's Signature: _____

5th June, 2023

Department of Law

Bahria University, Islamabad

Research Project for the Degree of LL.B.

DECLARATIONOF ETHICAL CONDUCT IN RESEARCH

"I hereby declare that this research paper titled "Independence and accountability of Judiciary: A case study of Pakistan (Analytical Study)" is my own research work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no such text or material which had previously been published nor material written by some other person previously which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma degree of any university or institute of a Higher Learning, except where due acknowledgment has been made in the text or that a reference has been made in the paper".

Date: 05-06-2023

Degree: LLB

Department: LAW

Supervisor: Madam Hafiza Amna Sadia

Name and Signature of Student:

Zain Alam Yousafzai

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to Allah, the Almighty, for the numerous blessings that he has bestowed upon me throughout my academic career. I ask Allah SWT to grant me the strength I need to successfully complete my research.

In the second place, I would like to offer my thanks to Madam Hafiza Amna Sadia, a professor at the School of Law at Bahria University in Islamabad, who serves as my research supervisor. With his aid, I was able to finish my research project, so I am very grateful to her. Working under his instruction and supervision was an honor that I will never forget. I am indebted to her for the support and assistance she has always provided. It was a wonderful opportunity and a significant advantage for me to carry out my research while she directed and supervised it. I would want to express my appreciation to my supervisor for all of the guidance and assistance she provided to me throughout my research. In addition, I would like to express my appreciation to Dr. Fayyaz, Head of the Law Department, for his consistent moral support. I would want to express my gratitude to all of my professors since they helped me with my research, and it is due to their assistance that I was able to complete my research report.

In conclusion, I'd want to express my gratitude to everyone who contributed in any way to the production and completion of my research report.

DEDICATION

This Thesis is dedicated to my family and friends.

PLAGIARISM REPORT

Independence and Accountability of Judiciary

ORIGINALITY REPORT

11%	8%	6%	2%
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	ro.uow.edu.au Internet Source	4%
2	link.springer.com Internet Source	1%
3	M. Ehteshamul Bari. "The Independence of the Judiciary in Bangladesh", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2022 Publication	1%
4	"The Culture of Judicial Independence in a Globalised World", Brill, 2017 Publication	1%
5	Submitted to Higher Education Commission Pakistan Student Paper	1%
6	vibdoc.com Internet Source	1%
7	Submitted to Vels University Student Paper	<1%
8	Lorne Neudorf. "The Dynamics of Judicial Independence", Springer Science and	<1%

	Business Media LLC, 2017 Publication	
9	Joe McIntyre. "The Judicial Function", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2019 Publication	<1 %
10	www.coursehero.com Internet Source	<1 %
11	axutongxue.cn Internet Source	<1 %
12	erepository.uonbi.ac.ke Internet Source	<1 %
13	www.researchgate.net Internet Source	<1 %
14	Nizam Ahmed. "Executive-Judiciary Relations in Bangladesh", Asian Affairs: An American Review, 2006 Publication	<1 %
15	www.sachajournals.com Internet Source	<1 %
16	Submitted to Saint Joseph's College of Maine Student Paper	<1 %
17	www.ipjj.org Internet Source	<1 %
18	"Legal profession", Commonwealth Law Bulletin, 2002 Publication	<1 %

19	Submitted to William Jewell College Student Paper	<1%
20	www.assignmentpoint.com Internet Source	<1%
21	www.ethiopianreporter.com Internet Source	<1%
22	www.tandfonline.com Internet Source	<1%
23	Submitted to Amity University Student Paper	<1%
24	Steven R. Minegar. "Judicial Accountability Versus the Separation of Powers", International Criminal Justice Review, 2011 Publication	<1%
25	Kate Malleson. "Judicial Training and Performance Appraisal: The Problem of Judicial Independence", Modern Law Review, 09/1997 Publication	<1%
26	epdf.pub Internet Source	<1%
27	Stephen Colbran. "The Limits of Judicial Accountability; the Role of Judicial Performance Evaluation", Legal Ethics, 2015 Publication	<1%

28	etheses.whiterose.ac.uk Internet Source	<1%
29	"African Parliaments", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2005 Publication	<1%
30	David Simmons**. "Aspects of Judicial Independence and Accountability – Lessons for the Commonwealth Caribbean?*", Commonwealth Law Bulletin, 2007 Publication	<1%
31	apps.americanbar.org Internet Source	<1%
32	archive.sclqld.org.au Internet Source	<1%
33	benjaminbarber.org Internet Source	<1%
34	bibliotecadigital.fgv.br Internet Source	<1%
35	ie-arafat.blogspot.com Internet Source	<1%
36	www.nsar.org.rs Internet Source	<1%
37	www.pdfio.com Internet Source	<1%
	www.thefridaytimes.com	

38	Internet Source	<1%

Exclude quotes	On	Exclude matches	< 5 words
Exclude bibliography	On		

Table of Contents

SUPERVISOR'S APPROVAL 1

DECLARATIONOF ETHICAL CONDUCT IN RESEARCH 2

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT 3

DEDICATION 4

PLAGIARISM REPORT 5

Abstract 12

Research Statement ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Introduction ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Literature Review ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Research Questions ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Research Objectives ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Research Methodology ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Chapter I ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Separation of Power's and Judicial Independence ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.1 Introduction ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.2 Meaning of the Doctrine ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.3 Concept of Separation of Power ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.3.1 The Executive Organ ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.3.2 The Legislative Organ ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.3.3 The Judicial Organ ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.4 Explanation of the Separation of power and Judicial Independence . **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.5 History of Judiciary in Pakistan ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.5.1 Hindu Period ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.5.2 British Period ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

1.5.3 Pakistan Period.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Chapter II .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Judicial Independence or Independence of Judiciary .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

2.1 Introduction .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

2.2 Individual Independence of Judiciary .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

2.3 Personal Independence.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

2.4 Substantive Independence .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

2.5 Internal Independence .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

2.6 Collective or Institutional Independence of Judiciary.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Chapter III.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Judicial Accountability .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

3.1 Introduction: .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

3.2 Judicial Accountability by Public Exposure .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

3.3 Reasons for Decision Making .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

3.4 Discipline and Conduct of Judges.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

3.5 Accountability by Lawyers .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Conclusion and Recommendations.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Conclusion.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Strengths .....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Weaknesses.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

References.....**Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Abstract

The idea that judges should be free to make their own decisions while still being held accountable is widely acknowledged to be an essential component of democratic societies. The public's trust in the legal system depends on the independence of the judiciary as well as its accountability to the people. This trust is necessary to ensure that court judgements are honored by the populace. It is essential for there to be a level playing field when it comes to the rule of law that the courts remain impartial. It safeguards fundamental rights and prevents the government from abusing the powers it has been granted. On the other hand, judicial accountability is an essential component of judicial independence.

This research study highlights the significance of taking the required steps to protect the independence of the legal system, as well as building a suitable system of judicial accountability without putting the independence of the judicial system at risk. It takes a look at the laws and practices in place in Pakistan to deal with a variety of concerns pertaining to the judicial system, including issues of judicial accountability and independence. In addition to this, it analyses a wide variety of sources in order to investigate the history of the judicial system as well as the current state of the judicial system. These sources include statutory law, secondary literature, and reports from the media, amongst others.

In this paper, the advantages and disadvantages of Pakistan's current judicial system are analyzed and discussed. In order to improve Pakistan's judicial independence and accountability, this report provides recommendations for techniques that can be used to maintain strengths and remedy deficiencies.