

**ANALYSIS OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAWS IN THE CONTEXT OF
GWADAR DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS UNDER CPEC, AND ITS
ADJACENT MARINE SPACE**



Supervised By

HAFIZA AMINA SADIA

Submitted By

SEHRISH MUSHTAQ

LLM (International and Maritime Laws)

01-278221-009

DEPARTMENT OF LAW

BAHRIA UNIVERSITY ISLAMABAD

ABSTRACT

Pakistan and China are strengthening their ties with trade-based partnerships, the spotlight of which is the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC). CPEC is a major infrastructure development project that aims to increase trade between the two countries as well as to enhance connectivity through road and marine routes. Gwadar development projects which hold the driving seat of the CPEC are of significant value, especially with regard to the provision of a marine route through the strait of Hormuz for the shipment of tons and tons of cargo/ oil as well as the incurring economic benefits. While CPEC offers significant economic benefits, it also poses challenges to marine policies and sustainable management of marine resources in Pakistan, as the heavy infrastructure-building activities take with them the opportunities for economic boosts as well as environmental concerns.

This thesis paper aims to scrutinize the activities of Gwadar developmental projects from the lens of assessing their impacts on the adjacent marine space of Pakistan, with the view of highlighting the significance of marine environmental protection in Pakistan. The existing legal documents and the mechanisms will also be evaluated and investigated to find out the grey areas in the legal frameworks and their subsequent betterment through legislation and policy-making by the relevant stakeholders.

There are various countries in the world where coastal developmental projects have posed serious threats to the adjacent marine space, while many countries through the use of proper environmental impact assessment mechanisms and strong legal frameworks have minimized the risks of the marine environment's degradation. This thesis paper also aims to highlight those best practices followed internationally. The ultimate goal of this research effort is to emphasize the legal dimensions of the issue under consideration and highlight the gaps and challenges in the statutory frameworks to assist policymakers in addressing the greater concern of marine environmental protection concerning coastal developmental projects in Pakistan with the special context of Gwadar port development.

Keywords: China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), Marine Environment, Environmental Protection, United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS), Sustainable Port Policies, Environment Impact Assessments, Gwadar Projects, Environmental Laws.

February 2024

RESEARCH THESIS FOR LLM DEGREE

Supervisor Approval

I hereby, forward this work done by,

SEHRISH MUSHTAQ

To the Research for the Final Evacuation,

Supervisor Name:

HAFIZA AMINA SADIA

Supervisor's Signatures

**DEPARTMENT OF LAW
BAHRIA UNIVERSITY ISLAMABAD**

RESEARCH THESIS FOR LLM DEGREE

Declaration of Ethical Conduct in Research

I as a student of *Bahria University, Islamabad Campus* hereby declares that firstly, I have abided by the research ethics while writing this research project.

Secondly, I have not committed any acts that may discredit or damage the credibility of my research thesis which includes but not limited to: falsification distortion of research findings or plagiarism.

Thirdly, I need to go through plagiarism check before submitting this research project.

Supervised By

HAFIZA AMINA SADIA

Submitted By

SEHRISH MUSHTAQ

LLM (International and Maritime Laws)

01-278221-009

DEPARTMENT OF LAW

BAHRIA UNIVERSITY ISLAMABAD

APPROVAL FOR EXAMINATION

Scholar's Name: **SEHRISH MUSHTAQ**

Registration No: **01-278221-009**

Program of Study: **LLM (International & Maritime Laws)**

Thesis Title: Analysis of the Environmental Laws in the Context of the Gwadar Development Projects under CPEC and its adjacent Marine Space

It is to certify that the above scholar's thesis has been completed to my satisfaction and, to my belief, its standard is appropriate for submission for examination. I have also conducted a plagiarism test of this thesis using HEC-prescribed software and found a similarity index of **14%** which is within the permissible limit set by the HEC for the LLM degree thesis. I have also found the thesis in a format recognized by the BU for the LLM thesis.

Principal Supervisor's Signature:

Date: _____

Name: **Madam Hafiza Amina Sadia**

AUTHOR’S DECLARATION

I, **Sehrish Mushtaq** hereby state that my LLM thesis titled “*Analysis of the Environmental Laws in the Context of the Gwadar Development Projects under CPEC and its adjacent marine space*” is my work and has not been submitted previously by me for taking any degree from this university Bahria University or anywhere else in the country/world. At any time if my statement is found to be incorrect even after my graduation, the University has the right to withdraw/cancel my LLM degree.

Name of Scholar: SEHRISH MUSHTAQ

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Truly grateful to Almighty Allah, the most beneficial and merciful, who bestowed me with the power and courage to complete my research thesis.

I am profoundly thankful to my supervisor, Respected Madam Hafiza Amina Sadia, whose valuable and timely suggestions and advice helped me refine my thesis.

I would like to thank our Dean Dr. Muhammad Fayaz, for his remarkable teaching and administrative skills and his outstanding professional support to the students whenever required.

I also like to extend my deepest gratitude to my all-faculty members specifically Sir Commodore Gardezi for his encouragement, intellectual guidance, kindness, and thought-provoking lectures.

I also extend my gratitude to my respected Bosses, for their generous support and kindness throughout my LLM degree.

Last but not least, I am deeply indebted to all of *my family members* for their unending love, understanding, patience, support, and encouragement throughout this painstaking process of thesis writing. I am highly grateful to the *special ones* in my life for the unwavering support and patience.

DEDICATION

Dedicated to the love of my life “*my Ammi & Abu*” for their selfless dedication, kindness, unwavering faith in my aspirations, and the beautiful dreams they have for their daughter.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAPA	American Association for Port Authorities
AR 2022-23	Audit Report for Financial Year 2022-23
Basel Convention	Basel Protocol on Liability and Compensation for Damage Resulting from Trans-Boundary Movement of Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal
BEPA, 2012	The Balochistan Environmental Protection Act, 2012
BRI	The Belt and Road Initiative
CBD, 1992	Convention on Biological Diversity, 1992
CGDSD	Coordinator General of the Department of State Development
CMA, 1998	The Canada Marine Act, 1998
Constitution	The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan
COPHCL	China Overseas Port Holding Company Limited
CPEC	China Pakistan Economic Corridor
CSA	Canada Shipping Act
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EMS	Environmental Management System
GDA	Gwadar Development Authority
GPA	Gwadar Port Authority
GPAO, 2002	Gwadar Port Authority Ordinance, 2002
IEE	Initial Environmental Examination
IMO	International Maritime Organization
ISO 14001	International Environmental Treaty Kaw and ISO 14001 Environmental Management system
MGD	Million Gallons per Day
MPA	Marine Protected Area
NAP	National Action Plan
PEPA, 1997	The Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997
PMSAA, 1994	The Pakistan Maritime Security Agency Act, 1994
PMZA	Pakistan Maritime Zones Act
Ramsar Convention	The Convention on Wetlands of International Importance, Ramsar, 1971
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SDPA, 2015	Sustainable Port Development Act of Australia, 2015

UNCLOS, 1982

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982

UNDP

United Nations Development Program

UNEP

United Nations Environment Program

UNFCCC

United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

WCED

World Commission on Environment and Development

WWF

World Wide Fund for Nature

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT-----	ii
APPROVAL FOR EXAMINATION -----	v
AUTHOR’S DECLARATION -----	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT -----	vii
RESEARCH STATEMENT: -----	1
INTRODUCTION: -----	1
LITERATURE REVIEW: -----	6
RESEARCH QUESTIONS: -----	8
RESEARCH OBJECTIVES:-----	8
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY: -----	9
CHAPTER NO: 01 -----	10
LEGAL INSIGHT OF GWADAR PORT DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS REGARDING MARINE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION IN PAKISTAN-----	10
INTRODUCTION: -----	10
1.1 GWADAR AND ITS DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS: -----	10
1.2 GWADAR PROJECTS AND ITS IMPACTS ON ADJACENT MARINE SPACE: -----	11
1.3 GWADAR PROJECTS AND ITS ADJACENT MARINE SPACE FROM A LEGAL LENS -----	15
1.4 LEGAL POLICIES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION IN PAKISTAN	16
1.4.1 NATIONAL ACTION PLAN-2000 -----	16
1.5 LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION IN PAKISTAN -----	17
1.5.1 SCRUTINIZING THE PAKISTAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ACT, 1997	18
1.5.1.1 DECENTRALIZATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL GOVERNANCE -----	20
1.5.2 THE BALOCHISTAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ACT, 2012 -----	21
1.5.3 PAKISTAN MARITIME SECURITY AGENCY ACT, 1994 -----	22
1.6 INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS-PAKISTAN IS SIGNATORY TO-----	23
1.7 IMPLEMENTATION MECHANISMS- PRACTICAL REALITIES AND THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK -----	24
1.8 CONCLUSION -----	27
CHAPTER NO:02 -----	28
INTERNATIONAL PRINCIPLES/POLICIES AND EXISTING LEGAL SETUP OF PAKISTAN REGARDING MARINE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION FROM COASTAL DEVELOPMENT-----	28

2.1	INTRODUCTION	28
2.2	GLOBAL LAWS ON THE ENVIRONMENT AND PAKISTAN	28
2.3	PROMINENT INTERNATIONAL MOVES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION	31
2.3.1	THE BRUNDTLAND COMMISSION	31
2.3.2	THE STOCKHOLM CONVENTION	31
2.3.3	THE RIO DECLARATION	32
2.3.4	THE UNITED NATIONS' 17 GOALS OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT	32
2.3.5	“INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL TREATY LAW AND ISO 14001 ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS”	33
2.4	EXISTING PRINCIPLES FOR CONTROL OF ENVIRONMENTAL DEGRADATION	33
2.4.1	THE PRECAUTIONARY PRINCIPLE:	34
2.4.2	THE PREVENTION PRINCIPLE:	34
2.4.3	THE “POLLUTOR-PAYS” PRINCIPLE:	35
2.4.4	THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PRINCIPLE:	35
2.4.5	THE INTEGRATION PRINCIPLE:	37
2.5	SOME IMPORTANT JUDICIAL DECISIONS FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION IN PAKISTAN:	38
2.5.1	SHEHLA ZIA vs WAPDA [PLD 1994 SC 693]	38
2.5.2.	SUO-MOTO CASE [PLD 1998 SC 102]	38
2.5.3.	SUO-MOTO CASE [1996 SCMR 543]	39
2.5.4.	SALT MINES LABOUR UNION vs DIRECTOR, INDUSTRIES & MINERAL DEVELOPMENT, GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB [1994 SCMR 2061]	39
2.5.5.	CIVIL PETITION NO. 55 OF 2020 BEFORE THE SUPREME COURT OF PAKISTAN	39
2.6	CONCLUSION	40
CHAPTER NO.03:		41
ANALYZING THE LEGAL MECHANICS OF COASTAL STATES FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE ADJACENT MARINE ENVIRONMENT		41
3.1	INTRODUCTION:	41
3.2	SUSTAINABLE PORT DEVELOPMENT ACT, 2015 OF AUSTRALIA	42
3.3	THE CANADA MARINE ACT, 1998	43
3.4	CONCLUSION	45
CHAPTER No:04		46

WAY FORWARD FOR THE IMPROVISATION OF THE EXISTING LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR PROTECTING THE COASTAL ENVIRONMENT IN PAKISTAN -----	46
4.1 INTRODUCTION:-----	46
4.2 SUSTAINABLE PORT POLICY:-----	46
4.3 EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL FRAMEWORKS- PAKISTAN IS A SIGNATORY TO:-----	48
4.4 CONSOLIDATION/COHERENCE OF THE STATUTORY AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK -----	48
4.5 EFFECTIVE LEGISLATION FOR TRANSLATING THE INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS IN THE EXISTING LEGAL FRAMEWORK -----	50
4.6 EFFECTIVE PARTICIPATION OF THE LOCAL COMMUNITY AND RELEVANT STAKEHOLDER IN THE POLICY FORMULATION -----	51
4.7 STRONG JUDICIAL SETUP FOR THE EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PENAL PROVISIONS -----	51
4.8 EFFECTIVE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENTS-----	52
4.9 PUBLIC INFORMATION ABOUT THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REPORT -----	53
4.10 AMENDMENTS IN THE BALOCHISTAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ACT, 2012-----	53
5. CONCLUSION -----	55
6. RECOMMENDATIONS-----	56
BIBLIOGRAPHY -----	58