THE UNREGULATED GIG ECONOMY - A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF LABOR LAWS IN PAKISTAN



Submitted By

Rida Naeem 01-278212-015

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Master of Laws (General)

Supervised by

Commander (R) Abdul Ghaffar

SCHOOL OF LAW

BAHRIA UNIVERSITY, ISLAMABAD

SEPTEMBER 2023

APPROVAL FOR EXAMINATION

Scholar's Name: Rida Naeem

Registration No: 01-278212-015

Programme of Study: LLM (General)

Thesis Title: THE UNREGULATED GIG ECONOMY - A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF

LABOR LAWS IN PAKISTAN

It is to certify that the above scholar's thesis has been completed to my satisfaction and, to my belief, its standard is appropriate for submission for examination. I have also conducted plagiarism test of this thesis using HEC prescribed software and found similarity index 5 % that is within the permissible limit set by the HEC for the LLM degree thesis. I have also found the thesis in a format recognized by the BU for the LLM thesis.

Principal Supervisor's Signature:
Commander (R) Abdul Ghaffar
School of Law
Date:

AUTHOR'S DECLARATION

I, Rida Naeem hereby state that my LLM thesis titled "THE UNREGULATED GIG

ECONOMY - A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF LABOR LAWS IN PAKISTAN" is my own

work and has not been submitted previously by me for taking any degree from Bahria

University or anywhere else in the country/world.

At any time if my statement is found to be incorrect even after my graduation, the

University has the right to withdraw/cancel my LLM degree.

Name of Scholar: Rida Naeem

Date: _____

IV

PLAGIARISM UNDERTAKING

I, solemnly declare that research work presented in the thesis titled "THE

<u>UNREGULATED GIG ECONOMY - A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF LABOR LAWS IN</u>

<u>PAKISTAN</u>" is solely my research work with no significant contribution from any other

person. Small contribution / help wherever taken has been duly acknowledged and that

complete thesis has been written by me.

I understand the zero-tolerance policy of the HEC and Bahria University towards

plagiarism. Therefore, I as an Author of the above titled thesis declare that no portion of

my thesis has been plagiarized and any material used as reference is properly

referred/cited.

I undertake that if I am found guilty of any formal plagiarism in the above titled thesis

even after award of LLM degree, the university reserves the right to withdraw/revoke my

LLM degree and that HEC and the University has the right to publish my name on the

HEC/University website on which names of scholars are placed who submitted

plagiarized thesis.

Scholar/Author's Sign:	
=	

Name of the Scholar: Rida Naeem

PLAGIARISM REPORT

ORIGIN	ALITY REPORT	
5 SIMIL	% 3% 1% 3% arity index internet sources publications student	PAPERS
PREMAI	Y SOURCES	
1	labourlaw.unibo.it Internet Source	1,
2	Submitted to Lehigh University Student Paper	1,
3	download.atlantis-press.com Internet Source	<19
4	www.pc.gov.pk Internet Source	<19
5	Submitted to Sim University Student Paper	<19
6	prr.hec.gov.pk Internet Source	<19
7	Submitted to The University of Manchester	<19
8	www.ilo.org Internet Source	<19
9	Submitted to Higher Education Commission Pakistan Student Paper	<19

DEDICATION

I dedicate my dissertation work to my family and many friends. A special feeling of gratitude to my loving parents. Their words of encouragement and push for tenacity ring in my ears. My friends have never left my side and provided me with moral, spiritual and emotional support.

I also want to dedicate this work to my supervisor who groomed and taught me with utmost due diligence and concern. Without their continuous support the thesis would not have been completed on time.

Thank you.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Alhamdulillah

In preparing this thesis, I was in contact with many people, researchers, academicians and practitioners. They have contributed towards my understanding and thoughts. In particular, I wish to express my sincere appreciation to my thesis supervisor, professor Commander (R) Abdul Ghaffar, for encouragement, guidance and critics. Without his continued support and interest, this thesis would not have been the same as presented here.

My sincere appreciation also extends to all my colleagues and others who have provided assistance at various occasions. Their views and tips are useful indeed. Unfortunately, it is not possible to list all of them in this limited space. I am grateful to all my family members

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ILO International Labor Organization (ILO)

FPRW International Labor Organization's Fundamental Principles and

Rights at Work

FLSA Fair Labor Standards Act

PBS Pakistan Bureau of Statistics

PILDAT Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency

MOITT Ministry of Information and Telecommunications

PTA Pakistan Telecommunications Authority

FWF Fair Work foundation

ILS International Labor Standards

IT Information Technology

NYCC New York City Council

CLR Centre of Labor Research

AB 5 Assembly Bill 5 (California)

FTC Federal Trade Commission

NLRB National Labor Relations Board

LIST OF CASES

- 1. Uber BV v Aslam [2021] UKSC 5.
- 2. O'Connor v. Uber Techs. 82 F. Supp. 3d 1133 (N.D. Cal. 2015).
- 3. Cotter v. Lyft, Inc. 60 F. Supp. 3d 1067 (N.D. Cal. 2015).
- Dynamex Operations W. v. Superior Court 4 Cal. 5th 903, 232 Cal. Rptr. 3d 1, 416
 P.3d 1 (2018).
- 5. Razak v. Uber Technologies Inc, No. 18-1944 (3d Cir. 2020).
- 6. Donovan v. Dial America Marketing 757 F.2d 1376 (3d Cir. 1985).
- 7. *KESC v NIRC* 2015, PLC 1.

LIST OF STATUTES

- 1. The Industrial Relations Act 2012 (Pakistan)
- 2. Provincial Employees Social Security Ordinance 1965 (Pakistan)
- 3. Industrial Relations Ordinance 1969 (Pakistan)
- 4. Industrial Disputes Ordinance 1959 (Pakistan)
- 5. Social Security Act 1935 (US)
- 6. The National Labor Relations Act 1935 (US)
- 7. Employment Rights Act 1996 (UK)

ABSTRACT

This study attempts to critically analyze the legal status of gig workers by thoroughly dissecting the legal frameworks governing gig work with a particular focus on the United Kingdom (UK), United States (US) and Pakistan. It begins by elucidating the profound impact of the gig economy on contemporary labor markets, underscoring the myriad challenges faced by gig workers in securing their fundamental rights. These rights encompass equitable compensation, access to insurance, paid leave, and the freedom to participate in trade unions. The gig economy, catalyzed by the fourth industrial revolution, has redefined labor markets, ushering in a new era of technology-driven work arrangements. This transformation has sparked debates worldwide regarding the appropriate legal classification of gig workers whether they should be designated as employees or independent contractors. The International Labor Organization (ILO) played an important role in addressing these global labor concerns. ILO conventions and recommendations lay down essential guidelines for universal labor rights, placing significant emphasis on the precise determination of employment status to ensure comprehensive social and labor protections. The investigation of this study is fully supported by the illustrative case studies from the UK, the US, and Pakistan, illuminating the legal battles and progress achieved in safeguarding the rights of gig workers. Notably, the Razak v. Uber Technologies case sets a significant precedent regarding gig workers' employment status and their entitlement to minimum wage and overtime protections. The developed nations like the UK and the US have made efforts in addressing the concerns of gig workers, formidable challenges persist but Pakistan is still struggling to deal with this sector. This study offers invaluable insights into the legal developments and case law in these countries and provides a comprehensive understanding of the global ramifications of gig work for labor rights and international legal obligations. Ultimately, it highlights the necessity for comprehensive legislation to be enacted for gig workers, addressing their needs and concerns more effectively.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

APPROVAL FOR EXAMINATION	II
AUTHOR'S DECLARATION	III
PLAGIARISM UNDERTAKING	IV
PLAGIARISM REPORT	V
DEDICATION	VI
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	VII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	VIII
LIST OF CASES	IX
LIST OF STATUTES	X
ABSTRACT	XI
SYNOPSIS	1
THESIS STATEMENT	1
INTRODUCTION	1
LITERATURE REVIEW	3
OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY	7
RESEARCH QUESTIONS	8
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	8
CHAPTER 1	9
UNVEILING THE GIG ECONOMY AND ITS IMPLICATIONS	9
1.1.Introduction	9
1.2.Historical Background	10
1.3.Understanding The Terms of Gig Economy	11
1.3.1.Gig Economy	11
1.3.2. Types Of Digital Labor Platforms	12
1.4.Challenges Faced by Gig Workers In Pakistan	13
1.5.Importance Of Regulation And Legal Framework For Gig	15
1.6.Conclusion	17
CHAPTER 2	18
THE STATUS OF GIG WORKERS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW: IN PEROF UNITED KINGDOM AND UNITED STATES LAWS	
2.1.Introduction	18
2.2.Role Of International Labor Organization in Digital Economy	19
2.3.Developed Countries Labor Standards and Protections for Gig	21
2.3.1.Analysis of the UK Laws and Regulations	22

2.3.1.1 Case Study and Key Legal Precedent	23
2.3.2.Analysis of US Laws and Regulations	25
2.3.2.1 At Federal Level	25
2.3.2.2 State Laws and Case laws	26
2.3.3.Case Study Highlighting Successful Approach in Support of Gig Workers	28
2.4.Conclusion	29
CHAPTER 3	31
A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF PAKISTANI LABOR LAWS: IN PERSPECTIVE O	
GIG WORKERS	31
3.1.Introduction	31
3.2.Pakistan's Emerging Tech Sectors	32
3.2.1.Gig Platforms in Pakistan	32
3.3. Securing Basic Labor Rights and ILO's Impact on Pakistan's Gig Economy	34
3.4.Evolution of Labor Laws in Pakistan	36
3.4.1.Former Governments Crea tion of Labor Legislation	37
3.5. Evaluation of The Effectiveness of Pakistan's Labor Laws for Gig Workers	38
3.6.Legal Status of Gig Workers in Pakistan's Legal Framework	41
3.7.Legislative Measures to Regulate Gig Economy	43
3.8.Conclusion	44
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	46
Conclusion	46
Recommendations	47
BIBLIOGRAPHY	50